

Digital Health CCIO Summer School 2018, University of Birmingham

Innovation or Evidence: Why can't we have both?

Dr Philip Scott, University of Portsmouth

Prof Niels Peek, University of Manchester

Asst Prof Mark Sujan, University of Warwick

Pre-reading: <http://journals.plos.org/plosmedicine/article?id=10.1371/journal.pmed.1000387>

(Read at least the Abstract, Introduction, Discussion, Conclusions)

1. Introductory presentations (30 min)

- Why should claims about digital health benefits be treated with caution?
- What do we know about the unintended consequences of digital health?
- How can we make independent evaluation of health IT into routine good practice?
- Does the need for evidence hinder innovation?
- Workshop setup

2. Workshop (60 min)

Sub-group practical session with prompts and direction from moderators

How to design an evaluation study for:

- Hospital EPMA, or
- Regional shared health and care record, or
- Community mental health EPR, or
- Some other project suggested by delegates in advance

3. Feedback (20 min)

Group feedback on most useful points

4. Conclusion/Q&A (10 min)

Summary points on evaluation methods [7, 8]

Questions on current/planned projects

Takeaway reading list (tbc)

Appendix: Background (Select some as a reading list)

Numerous basic research questions remain to be satisfactorily addressed in clinical informatics, including in the fields of:

- Cost effectiveness [9, 10]
- Efficiency/productivity [11-13]
- Impact on service utilisation [14]
- Patient empowerment/outcomes [15]
- Decision support [16]
- Usability and human factors [17, 18]
- Unintended consequences [19-22]
- Application of safety-critical software engineering methods [23].

References

- [1] Black AD, Car J, Pagliari C, Anandan C, Cresswell K, Bokun T, et al. The impact of eHealth on the quality and safety of health care: a systematic overview. *PLoS Med.* 2011 Jan 18;8(1):e1000387.
- [2] Soumerai SB, Starr D, Majumdar SR. How do you know which health care effectiveness research you can trust? A guide to study design for the perplexed. *Preventing Chronic Disease.* 2015;12(E101).
- [3] Georgiou A. Finding, Appraising and Interpreting the Evidence of Health IT. *Stud Health Technol Inform.* 2016;222:312-23.
- [4] Salter KL, Kothari A. Using realist evaluation to open the black box of knowledge translation: a state-of-the-art review. *Implement Sci.* 2014;9:115.
- [5] Lilford RJ, Chilton PJ, Hemming K, Girling AJ, Taylor CA, Barach P. Evaluating policy and service interventions: framework to guide selection and interpretation of study end points. *BMJ.* 2010 Aug 27;341:c4413.
- [6] Coiera E. *Guide to Health Informatics.* 3rd ed. Abingdon: CRC press; 2015.
- [7] Ammenwerth E, Rigby M, editors. *Evidence-Based Health Informatics;* 2016.
- [8] Friedman CP, Wyatt J. *Evaluation methods in biomedical informatics:* Springer Science & Business Media; 2005.
- [9] Reis ZSN, Maia TA, Marcolino MS, Becerra-Posada F, Novillo-Ortiz D, Ribeiro ALP. Is There Evidence of Cost Benefits of Electronic Medical Records, Standards, or Interoperability in Hospital Information Systems? Overview of Systematic Reviews. *JMIR Medical Informatics.* 2017;5(3):e26.
- [10] Dranove D, Forman C, Goldfarb A, Greenstein S. The Trillion Dollar Conundrum: Complementarities and Health Information Technology. National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper Series. 2012;No. 18281.
- [11] Friedberg MW, Chen PG, Van Busum KR, Aunon F, Pham C, Caloyeras J, et al. Factors Affecting Physician Professional Satisfaction and Their Implications for Patient Care, Health Systems, and Health Policy. *Rand Health Quarterly.* 2014;3(4):1.
- [12] Hill RG, Jr., Sears LM, Melanson SW. 4000 clicks: a productivity analysis of electronic medical records in a community hospital ED. *Am J Emerg Med.* 2013 Nov;31(11):1591-4.

- [13] Heponiemi T, Hypponen H, Vehko T, Kujala S, Aalto AM, Vanska J, et al. Finnish physicians' stress related to information systems keeps increasing: a longitudinal three-wave survey study. *BMC Med Inform Decis Mak.* 2017 Oct 17;17(1):147.
- [14] Kash BA, Baek J, Davis E, Champagne-Langabeer T, Langabeer JR, 2nd. Review of successful hospital readmission reduction strategies and the role of health information exchange. *Int J Med Inform.* 2017 Aug;104:97-104.
- [15] Rigby M, Georgiou A, Hypponen H, Ammenwerth E, de Keizer N, Magrabi F, et al. Patient Portals as a Means of Information and Communication Technology Support to Patient- Centric Care Coordination - the Missing Evidence and the Challenges of Evaluation. A joint contribution of IMIA WG EVAL and EFMI WG EVAL. *Yearb Med Inform.* 2015;10(1):148-59.
- [16] Ammenwerth E, Nykanen P, Rigby M, de Keizer N. Clinical decision support systems: need for evidence, need for evaluation. *Artif Intell Med.* 2013;59(1):1-3.
- [17] Marcilly R, Peute L, Beuscart-Zephir MC. From Usability Engineering to Evidence-based Usability in Health IT. *Stud Health Technol Inform.* 2016;222:126-38.
- [18] Turner P, Kushniruk A, Nohr C. Are We There Yet? Human Factors Knowledge and Health Information Technology - the Challenges of Implementation and Impact. *Yearb Med Inform.* 2017;26(1):84-91.
- [19] Coiera E, Ash J, Berg M. The Unintended Consequences of Health Information Technology Revisited. *Yearb Med Inform.* 2016 Nov 10(1):163-169.
- [20] Schiff GD, Amato MG, Eguale T, Boehne JJ, Wright A, Koppel R, et al. Computerised physician order entry-related medication errors: analysis of reported errors and vulnerability testing of current systems. *BMJ Qual Saf.* 2015 Apr;24(4):264-71.
- [21] Amato MG, Salazar A, Hickman TT, Quist AJ, Volk LA, Wright A, et al. Computerized prescriber order entry-related patient safety reports: analysis of 2522 medication errors. *J Am Med Inform Assoc.* 2017 Mar 1;24(2):316-322.
- [22] Cresswell KM, Bates DW, Williams R, Morrison Z, Slee A, Coleman J, et al. Evaluation of medium-term consequences of implementing commercial computerized physician order entry and clinical decision support prescribing systems in two 'early adopter' hospitals. *J Am Med Inform Assoc.* 2014 Oct;21(e2):e194-202.
- [23] Thomas M. Making software correct by construction. Gresham College; 2017.